

COMMENTS
DRAFT WINTER AND SPRING 2011 AVIAN COMMUNITY SURVEY DATA REPORT
FOR THE LOWER PASSAIC RIVER STUDY AREA
DATED JULY 17, 2012

<u>No.</u>	<u>General Comment</u>
1	There are a number of places in the document where it is unclear whether the discussion is meant to focus on overall observations of birds or just those pertaining to aquatic and semi-aquatic species. If the goal is to focus on aquatic and semi-aquatic birds as these species are "important for the BERA" as noted in the second paragraph of Section 3 on Page 19 it is recommended that each group of birds be discussed separately for better clarity.

<u>No.</u>	<u>Page No.</u>	<u>Specific Comments</u>
1	Page 19, Section 3, second paragraph, third sentence	Use of the term "other species" to describe an entire grouping of birds is a bit broad. Please further define.
2	Page 21, Section 3.1.2, second paragraph, last sentence	It is assumed that the statement "Of the six wading birds observed, three were observed in flight." refers to great blue herons. Please clarify.
3	Page 26, Section 3.2.1, fifth sentence and Appendix G	Fifth sentence "A comprehensive species list is presented in Appendix G." - For the yellow-shafted flicker the latin name in Appendix G should be " <i>Colaptes a. auratus</i> " to distinguish it from the northern flicker " <i>Colaptes auratus</i> ". Please revise.
4	Page 26, Table 3-2 and Appendix G	"Redstart" should be listed as "American redstart". Appendix G should also be revised to reflect this.
5	Page 27, Section 3.2.2, second paragraph, second sentence	Please further expand on, or clarify "other species".
6	Page 31, Section 3.3, first sentence	The text states that 1601 individuals and 27 different species were observed during the Spring 2011 survey; however, Section 3.2.2 states 1600 and 26. Please revise as appropriate.
7	Page 32, First paragraph, second sentence	The text states that five species of shorebirds were observed during the Spring survey. Review of Appendix D shows six. Killdeer is not mentioned or included in the summary of shorebird species in the text. Please revise.

8	Page 32, First paragraph, last sentence	The text states that mallard and American black duck were only observed during the spring survey. Review of Appendix D shows that both species were observed during both the spring and winter surveys. Please revise.
9	Page 33, Section 4, second paragraph	In its current form it's difficult to understand the information being conveyed. Is the purpose of the discussion to focus on total bird counts or only those that fall into the category of aquatic and semi-aquatic species? Please revise for clarity.
10	Page 38, Section 5, first paragraph	The text defines the "other" species category as "the eight aquatic and semi-aquatic species that do not fit in the categories of gulls, terns, shorebirds, swans, geese, ducks, or wading birds. These species include bald eagle, belted kingfisher, double-breasted cormorant, Northern waterthrush, osprey, red-winged blackbird, rusty blackbird, and tree swallow." For better clarity it is recommended that this information appear at the beginning of the document when the term "other species" is initially brought into the discussion.
11	Appendix A, page 2	Please note the typographical error under the column "Start Time". Please revise the time for location LPRA17 to read 14:34.